

COMPLETION REPORT OF THE ITTO PROJECT

STRENGTHENING THE NATIONAL PROCESS FOR CONTROLLING ILLEGAL LOGGING AND ASSOCIATED TRADE IN CAMEROON



Hosting Government :
Republic of Cameroon

Submitted by :
TRAFFIC, the Wildlife Trade Monitoring Network

July 2014



TRAFFIC
the wildlife trade monitoring network

a) Project Number:	TFL-PD 003/09 Rev.2 (M)
b) Starting Date of the Project:	October, 2011
c) Duration of the Project (Months):	30 (Including a 6-month extension with no-cost approved by ITTO on October 18, 2013 NOL Ref. F. 13-0261).
d) Project Costs (US\$):	418,626
e) The ordinal number and type of the Report	Project Completion Report

Project Technical and scientific staff - names of Project Coordinator and main staff

- Denis MAHONGHOL, Project Coordinator, TRAFFIC Central Africa;
- Germain NGANDJUI, Senior Programme Officer, TRAFFIC Central Africa, project management national (Central African Technical Assistant);
- Louisette Ngo YEBEL épouse FOUNGA, TRAFFIC Central Africa, Communication Officer ;
- Donald Sunday KIGHAM, Administrative & Financial Officer, TRAFFIC Central Africa; Finance – national;
- Graham SYMONS, Project Administrative Officer, TRAFFIC International; Finance international.

<p>Institution TRAFFIC International 219a, Huntingdon Road, Cambridge CB3 0DL United Kingdom Tel: (44) 1223 277427 Fax: (44) 1223 277237 Email traffic@traffic.org</p>	<p>Implementation office: TRAFFIC Central Africa c/o IUCN-PACO, BP 5506 Yaounde, Cameroon Tel: (237) 2206 7409 Fax: (237) 2221 3218 Email: tcaf@traffic.org</p>
<p>The Place And Date The Report Was Issued. TRAFFIC Yaounde Cameroon</p>	

July 2014

Disclaimer

This report was prepared as an account of Project sponsored by ITTO and executed by TRAFFIC, the Wildlife Trade Monitoring Network under the Supervision of the Ministry of Forestry and Wildlife (MINFOF) of Cameroon. Neither ITTO nor TRAFFIC thereof, nor any of their stakeholders, nor any individual makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or any third party's use of results of the attached reports or any information, apparatus, product, or process disclosed, or represents that its use would not infringe privately owned rights. Reference herein to any specific product, process, or service by trade name, or otherwise, does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation, or favouring by the EA thereof. The views and opinions of the EA expressed herein do not necessarily state or reflect those of the Cameroon Government or ITTO or any agency thereof.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
1. PROJECT IDENTIFICATION	7
1.1. Context	7
1.2. Origin and Problem.....	8
Origin	8
Problems Addressed.....	9
2. PROJECT OBJECTIVES AND IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGY	9
2.1. Development objective.....	9
2.2. Specific objective	9
2.3. Strategy adopted in carrying out the project.....	10
2.4. Assumptions and risks	10
3. PROJECT PERFORMANCE (PROJECT ELEMENTS PLANNED AND IMPLEMENTED)	11
3.1. The realized performance versus the planned performance, indicating precisely the differences between planned and realized Project elements.	11
At the level of Specific Objective(s)	11
At the level of Outputs and related Activities:.....	11
Schedule	13
Total amount of expenditures: analysis of applied input.....	13
4. PROJECT OUTCOME, TARGET BENEFICIARIES INVOLVEMENT	14
4.1. The Extent to which the project specific objective(s) was achieved	14
4.2. The situation existing at Project Completion as compared to the pre-Project situation.....	14
The tangible outputs of the Project	14
Sectoral policies and programs	15
The Physical Environment.....	15
4.3. Participation of the target beneficiaries in the implementation of the Project and their utilization of the project results.	15
Other Ministries (Finance, Justice, Arm Forces).....	16
Timber exploiters	16
4.4. Project Sustainability after Project Completion As A Result Of Conditions Prevailing At Completion.....	16
5. ASSESSMENT AND ANALYSIS	16
5.1. Project rationale and the Project identification process	16
5.2. Adequacy/Inadequacy of the results of the identification process	17
5.3. The most critical differences between planned and actual project implementation	17

5.4. Time And Project Inputs: Personnel And Equipment, Financial Resources, Knowledge And Expertise	18
5.5. Anticipation and reality of external influences, assumptions and risks and the effectiveness of mitigating measures	19
5.6. The participation of anticipated and actual Project beneficiaries in Project implementation and how they have and will be benefiting from the Project.....	19
5.7. Sustainability after Project Completion.....	19
5.8. The understanding and appropriateness of the roles and responsibilities of the institutions involved with the project implementation.	20
6. LESSONS LEARNED.....	20
6.1. Development Lessons.....	20
6.2. Operational Lessons.....	21
7. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	22
7.1. Conclusions and Recommendations	22
Identification.....	22
Design.....	22
Implementation.....	22
Organisation	23
Management.....	23
7.2. Potential for replication and/or for scaling up	23
Annexes	24

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Forests are a key resource for Cameroon and its people, due to its rich and diverse biodiversity. Timber and Non Timber Forest Products provide numerous socio-economic benefits to local forest communities and the government while the forest ecosystem provide multiple environmental services (watershed, carbon sequestration, soil stability) of benefit to Cameroon and the world at large; therefore the country is committed to sustainable management of forests. The need to strengthen capacities in sustainable forest management in Cameroon has resulted in several organizational metamorphoses shaping and reshaping the Ministry in charge of forests as well as encouraging the participation of the civil society in forest and wildlife management. To enhance transparency, MINFOF worked in collaboration with an independent observer, Resource Extraction Monitoring (REM) (2005-2009 and with the consortium of NGOs called AGRECO in 2010-2013 as well as a local NGO Cameroon Environmental Watch (CEW)) in monitoring legality in forest concessions and check points along transportation roads. The collaborative controls along roads was important because Cameroon is a key transit country for timber coming from neighboring countries (Chad and Central Africa). Cameroon has officially engaged in the FLEGT Voluntary Partnership Agreements (VPA) with the European Union (EU). The VPA was signed in October 2010 and entered into force on December 2010. This constant search to improve governance and transparency of timber harvests and trade in Cameroon is in line with the ITTO Sustainable Forest Management objectives. In spite of these laudable efforts, there are still incidences of illegality throughout the timber trade supply chain, partly due to inadequate staff and capacity, poor coordination with other enforcement agencies such as Customs, and a lack of information on focal areas of illegality in the supply chain. Problems also exist in ensuring equitable sharing of benefits with local communities and ensuring that the impact of logging on the availability of useful plant and animal products is minimized.

This project (ITTO TFL-PD 003/09 Rev. 2 (M)) was therefore designed to contribute to the improvement of governance and transparency of timber harvested and traded in Cameroon and internationally. This was to be achieved by strengthening the national process for controlling illegal logging and associated trade in Cameroon in order to contribute to transparency of timber trade with a view to address the problems of unsustainable timber harvesting, weak forest law enforcement and illegal trade of the country's timber. The Project was executed in close collaboration with the Ministry of Forestry and Wildlife (MINFOF) via the Focal Point. In accordance with the Project Document action was taken to ensure that relevant stakeholders in the forestry and conservation sector were represented on the Project Technical Committee (PTC). PTC members included representatives from: MINFOF, ITTO, TRAFFIC, and International Union for Conservation of the Nature (IUCN) and the World Fund for Nature (WWF). The secretariat was assured by the Project Coordinator and the MINFOF Focal Point.

Over the project implementation period, a total of four training of trainer's workshops on forest law enforcement, forest regulation and control were conducted that befitted more than one hundred participants of whom sixty-five were direct beneficiaries (22 from MINFOF; 20 from the Ministry of Finance; 09 from the Ministry of Justice; 08 from Gendarmerie and 06 from Police) and the rest indirect stakeholders. The project developed a manual on forest legislation and control with five modules based on the various capacity building workshops organized by the project. Five studies were conducted and are annexed to this report on the following i) to update timber trade routes in the country; ii) to evaluate the status FLE monitoring in Cameroon; iii) to review the timber traceability system in Cameroon; iv) to develop a work plan for FLE and v) to develop an information management and communication to the public on illegal timber trade activities to foster transparency. The project has also produced 2 maps of the main timber trade roads as part of the study indicated in I; a code of conduct and professional ethics has also been prepared as an annex

to the study to the monitoring of FLW in Cameroon. In order to foster relations between relevant stakeholders, an agreement has been reached to put in place a National Coordination Unit on forest law enforcement under the auspices of the Prime Minister Offices.

In spite of the difficulties and challenges encountered during the implementation of this project, significant achievements were made which has resulted in the improvements in improved capacity and forest law enforcement as compared to the period before the project.. Stakeholders were trained, informed and sensitized on forestry law and the fight against illegal logging and associated trade. The various government stakeholders in the agencies now know their roles and responsibilities of better, and how and where and when they should collaborate based on their mandate and legal frameworks.

1. PROJECT IDENTIFICATION

1.1. Context

The broad context for the project was the response to the pressing need for strengthening the national process for controlling illegal logging and associated trade in Cameroon for better forest management that reconciles the interests of the growing logging industry with those dependent on forest resources as well as those regulating, monitoring and coordinating the activities of the timber sector. This project builds on the substantive work carried out by the project partners on sustainable forest management in Cameroon and beyond to address issues related to industrial logging concessions and artisanal logging.

As part of the Congo Basin forests that constitute the second largest continuous rainforest in the world, Cameroon forests actively contribute to the world's environmental stability and are used as economic resources to produce subsistence and industrial forest products. They are home to a large number of species, therefore acting as a stronghold to safeguard biodiversity. They also serve as a living habitat for many indigenous and non-indigenous people.

This project covered the entire Cameroon forest ecosystem (especially the South, East & Centre regions) documenting (including mapping where appropriate), and gathering information of the timber routes, assessing legality of timber producing and processing sites, along timber routes, including cross border routes, at timber check points and import and export sites.

According to the traditional macroeconomic analysis: the added value of the forestry sector represented consistently 2.7% of the total value added (GDP) between 2008 and 2010 in Cameroon. This contribution is greater than the contribution of the mining sector excluding oil (0.18% of GDP in 2010). This analysis estimated that taking 2010 as the reference, the contribution to government revenue including non-deductible VAT, taxes on products, income taxes on imports and taxes on exports is 18.176 billion CFA for forest-wildlife sector (CIFOR, 2013). With regard to formal employment, they are mostly related to industrial forest exploitation and timber processing factories. Thematic analyzes identifies 22,722 direct permanent jobs of which 21,902 jobs in the industrial timber work and 802 jobs related to sport hunting industry. Moreover, the informal channels involve hundreds of thousands of individuals including about 44,000 in the artisanal logging, 460,000 for the village hunting, 90,000 full-time equivalent jobs for harvesting and supply of urban areas in wood-energy.

This encouraging macro-economic and social situation is particularly the result of Cameroon's efforts on its regulatory framework, notably: the adoption by the national authorities of the National Forest Policy in 1993, the Forest Law enacted in 1994, a framework law on the environment in 1996, the Yaoundé Declaration in 1999 with the adoption of the Convergence Plan of the Central African Commission on Forests (COMIFAC), the inclusion of this Convergence Plan in the Strategy Paper for Poverty Reduction in 2003, commitments with AFLEG and FLEGT and finally the recent signing of the FLEGT-VPA with the EU in October 2010. For more transparency and credibility in the forest sector control systems and procedures, the Ministry has accepted to work with an independent observer (REM from 2005 to 2009 and the consortium AGRECO-CEW from 2010 to 2013) who constantly informs national and international opinions on the successes and weaknesses of control mechanism in Cameroon. This allows Cameroon to develop strategies to capitalize on its successes and implement solutions to overcome the weaknesses.

For better benefits to the forest-wildlife sector, to improve governance and preserve biodiversity and ecosystems, the national strategy document for forests and wildlife control, including its annexes was produced and must make operational all laws and regulations. But the remark made by MINFOF (2005) in this document and which was still the reality before the implementation of the present project, demonstrates that the implementation of this regulation poses enormous problems among stakeholders, the most important being:

- poor understanding by officials committed to forest control of laws and regulations, procedures and methods of control in force;
- difficulty for the Ministry of Forestry and Wildlife to perform its functions effectively due to gaps at the organizational level, skills and equipment;
- limited involvement of civil society and economic operators in the implementation of forest policy;
- Weak collaboration with other services involved in the control (Customs, Justice, Police, Gendarmerie, Finance, etc.).

In the specific context of timber harvesting, its derivatives and associated trade, based on its geographical position, Cameroon is special because its territory is used as a transit corridor for some or most of the timber production exports from the countries of the region (Lewis, 2011). Similarly, by its road network developed enough (5,133 km of paved roads, 12,799 km of unpaved roads and 59,657 km of tracks and paths for a total of 77,589 Km ([www.mintp.cm/fr/projets- achievements / presentation-of-network-road](http://www.mintp.cm/fr/projets-achievements/presentation-of-network-road))), the flow of timber from operational forest sites to the main exit which is the Douala sea port (open to the Atlantic Ocean unlike neighboring countries tropical timbers producers) is easy. Timbers from the Central African Republic (CAR) and the north of Republic of Congo, northern Gabon and northern Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC) via the CAR pass exclusively by Cameroon (Lewis, 2011).

However, and given the difficulties mentioned above by MINFOF, statistical flow of this timber are not well known, less capitalized and probably a direct result of illegal logging.

1.2. Origin and Problem

Origin

The project was derived from the recommendations of addressing some of the problems observed on the sustainability of the Cameroon previous ITTO funded project (e.g. PD047/98 Rev.2 (M) “*Establishing a data collection and dissemination system on sustainable basis for timber marketing statistics in Cameroon*”), implemented from 2001 to 2005. The main aim of the project was the establishment of a database (Commercialisation du bois Camerounais – COMCAM) to register information related to timber traceability including exporters, volume, quantity of special products, destination countries. Unfortunately, the project has not worked properly due to many reasons; the most important quite often given being the Government’s limited capacity to monitor forestry activities and ensure compliance by forest managers with current legislation. Therefore, this project was an attempt to address the problem.

The second and important reason for this project was the willingness to support the efficient implementation of the national strategy for forest and wildlife controls produced by the MINFOF in 2005, which mentioned problems among stakeholders as stated in the previous section 1.1.

Finally, as a high priority under the Timber Forest Law Enforcement and Trade (TFLET) Programme of ITTO, strengthening forest law compliance and governance (through improving policy and legal frameworks and strengthening institutions, improving data) improve transparency and effective management of supply chains and increased domestic

and international trade in legally produced tropical timber; improve international cooperation in forest law enforcement and governance, very few projects have been submitted by Central African tropical timbers' producers or funded by ITTO on combatting illegal logging and associated trade.

Problems Addressed

The project was designed to contribute to the improvement of governance and transparency of timber harvest and traded in Cameroon and internationally by strengthening the national process for controlling illegal logging and associated trade in Cameroon in order to contribute to transparency of timber trade in Cameroon with a view to addressing the problems of unsustainable timber harvesting, weak forest law enforcement and illegal trade of the country's timber. Expected outcomes were related to improvement in efficiency and effectiveness of FLEGT; better enforcement of forest laws and regulations through chain of custody and tracking and tracing systems; increased market opportunities for legally and sustainably produced timber; enhanced capacity of trade associations and civil society organizations; and policies and programmes to improve FLEGT contributing to the implementation of ITTO objectives and other international objectives and bilateral initiatives.

2. PROJECT OBJECTIVES AND IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGY

2.1. Development objective

The development objective of the project was to contribute to transparency of timber trade in Cameroon with a view to address the problems of unsustainable timber harvesting, weak forest law enforcement and illegal trade of the country's timber. It was expected that:

- By the end of 2013, capture of revenue by government from timber export increases of 20%.
- By the end 2012, a large cadre of officials is trained to strengthen forest law enforcement, control of illegal logging and related timber trade in Cameroon.
- By 2015, all timber exported by Cameroon is harvested in certified forests.

2.2. Specific objective

The specific objective of the project was to strengthen the national process for controlling illegal logging and associated trade in Cameroon. It was expected that:

- By the end of the project, services of relevant ministries (MINFOF, Ministry of Finance or MINFI, Justice, Police and Gendarmerie) coordinate to control illegal logging and associated trade.
- At the end of first year of the project, an interagency system of information on logging, sawmilling and timber trade is operational, and is providing improved information to communities on their share of tax revenues.
- At the end of the project, there is total compliance of large and small-scale logging and sawmilling enterprises.

As a consequence of readjustment made during the implementation phase, the project led to the following activities and outputs: development of training materials dedicated to forest legislation and control towards the fight against illegal logging in Cameroon; development of a database of stakeholders involved in forest law enforcement in Cameroon; initiation of a mechanism for inter-agency collaboration (inter-agency committee); identification and update of threats and gaps in timber trade legislation and traceability (Système Informatique de Gestion de l'Information Forestière-SIGIF) in Cameroon supported by two maps indicating

both the official, and the illegal timber trade routes; initiation of the development of an online timber trade information management system dedicated to more transparency and communication with the wider public and stakeholders; report documenting the gaps and threats to timber trade especially among law enforcement agents in Cameroon.

2.3. Strategy adopted in carrying out the project

In the formulation and design of the project, which emphasized the importance of strengthening the national process for controlling illegal logging and associated trade in Cameroon for national development and sustainable forest management; outputs were achieved in a participatory and consultative approach that engages all the relevant stakeholders, in establishing a framework that connects research, business and policy in a multi-stakeholders platform. The underlying philosophy for the implementation of this project was based on the concept of participatory and consultation approach throughout the project life cycle. The skills of TRAFFIC network staffs, expert consultants and MINFOF's Focal Point of the project were solicited through training workshops and technical meetings. Throughout the project implementation, two main meetings of the Project Technical Committee (PTC)¹ were held to evaluate each activity, in order to make adjustments where necessary, and to align the project in meeting its goals.

The overall thrust of the project during its implementation was the dissemination of lessons learnt and sharing of project results and other related information through the organization of meetings with partners and participation & presentation at workshops and fora.

The project execution ensured a strict adherence to the project rubric and heeded to the original and amended workplan. Where changes in the original work-plan had to be made they were done with the approval from the ITTO through the PTC recommendations captured in the minutes of the PTC meetings.

2.4. Assumptions and risks

The project was implemented on the assumptions that the Cameroon Government through the Ministry of Forestry and Wildlife (MINFOF) and other beneficiaries' ministries would be involved as followed:

- MINFOF will continue to play a proactive role in ensuring the implementation of FLE.
- MINFOF and other relevant ministries take concrete steps to strengthen inter-services coordination for FLE starting from the first quarter of the project.
- Before the project started, MINFOF nominates the staff required for the implementation of the project.
- The Ministries will timely select participants to the training
- MINFOF ensures that the FLE Coordination Committee is set-up as planned
- MINFOF will approve a mechanism for the settlement of disputes related to access to information on the timber sector.
- The government guaranties independence of timber legality monitoring.

To address this, stakeholders' participation was well managed. This resulted in multi-sector, inter-agency and fair stakeholder group representation in project workshops, deliberations and discussions. The Government has been fully involved with the participation at high level of the Prime Minister's Office in the general workshop launching the capacity building phase of the project, with the nomination of the MINFOF's Focal Point to liaise with the project coordination and the designation by all the beneficiaries' ministries of selected staff to train.

¹ Members of the PTC comprises: chair (Secretary General, MINFOF); co-chair (ITTO); representatives of IUCN (01), WWF(01), Independent Observer (01), TRAFFIC (01) and two reporters (Project Coordinator and the MINFOF Focal Point of the Project).

3. PROJECT PERFORMANCE (PROJECT ELEMENTS PLANNED AND IMPLEMENTED)

3.1. The realized performance versus the planned performance, indicating precisely the differences between planned and realized Project elements.

At the level of Specific Objective(s)

“To strengthen the national process for controlling illegal logging and associated trade in Cameroon”.

Realized

The project was able to achieve its specific objective without any variations. The project organized four training of trainer’s workshops and one technical meeting to validate the training toolkit which include a training manual on forest legislation and control with five modules.) Capacity of more than sixty government officials on forest law enforcement was enhanced by the project. Five studies were conducted during the project; one reviewed and updated the map of the timber trade routes in Cameroon, the second develop a guidelines for the establishment and functioning of an interagency national coordination committee for forest law enforcement, the third was an assessment of the implementation of the forestry law with a proposed a code of conduct and professional ethics for, the other study reviewed and updated the traceability system in Cameroon as well as to assess the information management system of the Ministry of Forestry and Wildlife for better communication to public to promote transparency. It is expected that the stakeholders and the government of Cameroon will continue to seek support from ITTO to consolidate these results and to operationalize the interagency national coordination committee for FLE which terms of reference were established by this project.

At the level of Outputs and related Activities:

Planned	Realized Project Elements	Differences between Planned and Realized Project Elements
<i>Output 1: Implementation capacity of FLE of MINFOF and enforcement services strengthened.</i>	Achieved at 99%	None
Activity 1.1: Train trainers of MINFOF staff in Cameroon forest law and its enforcement	Activity done and report produced. A total of 22 MINFOF officials benefited from two training of trainer’s workshops organized by the project. Part of the workshop involved the review of the training modules on law enforcement developed by a consultant recruited by the project Inputs from workshop have been incorporated in the	

Planned	Realized Project Elements	Differences between Planned and Realized Project Elements
	final version of the manual.	
Activity 1.2: Train trainers of Customs and Tax services and other services (Police and Gendarmerie) in relevant FLE aspects of their work.	Done and reported produced. Forty three (43) officials from Finance (Customs and Tax), Justice, Police and Gendarmerie were trained in three training of trainer's workshops. During these workshops, the draft training modules on forest law enforcement developed by a consultant were presented and discussed by participants. Relevant and useful contributions from the participants have been incorporated into the manual.	
Activity 1.3: Train forest logging companies in relevant FLE aspects of their work	Activity completed with the participation of six logging companies including representative of logging companies and Douala sea port timber's parks in the first training of trainer's workshop. They benefited from discussions during the meeting and have the opportunity to debate on their difficulties related to their daily work in the field.	
Activity 1.4: Conduct a study to gather information on timber routes.	Activity carried out, a report is available with maps identifying new timber routes from production zones of eastern region to the northern Cameroon and Nigeria, Chad.	Report under clearance and validation meeting with MINFOF not held.
Output 2: Coordination of relevant government services for forest law enforcement strengthened	Achieved at 90%	None
Activity 2.1: Elaborate and seek an interagency workplan for FLE	Activity carried out, a draft report on the interagency national coordination committee workplan available.	Draft report under TRAFFIC clearance. To be submitted in early October 2014 to ITTO.
Activity 2.2: Establish an interagency coordination committee for FLE	Activity not completed. However, the terms of reference for the establishment of the committee have been prepared with strong recommendation that it should be managed by the prime minister office since it involves several ministries	Terms of reference have not been finalized and committee was not launched. This is partly due to the amount of advocacy and time required to get this community in place.
Output 3: Transparency of timber legality systems in	Achieved at 95%	None

Planned	Realized Project Elements	Differences between Planned and Realized Project Elements
Cameroon improved		
Activity 3.1: Develop and implement procedures for the monitoring of FLE	Activity done and draft report prepared. A draft code of conduct and professional ethics for forest controllers in Cameroon has also been produced.	Documents are still being reviewed by TRAFFIC communication team. To be submitted early October 2014 to ITTO.
Activity 3.2: Supporting current development of traceability systems that the government of Cameroon is developing and testing	Activity carried out, draft report on status of the traceability systems in Cameroon produced and available.	Draft report under TRAFFIC clearance. To be submitted early October 2014 to ITTO. Original activity 3.2. Set-up timber origin tracing systems and install timber monitoring equipment as stated in the project document was modified (based on the inception report) to focus on supporting current development of traceability systems that the government of Cameroon is developing and testing, in particular Geographical Forest Information System (SIGIF) under MINFOF funded by the EU. The coordination unit of the project deemed it necessary for this activity to build on ongoing work on the ground and capitalize on available results.
Activity 3.3: Develop an information system for the monitoring of forest products trade	Activity done and report prepared and submitted. Actual field work focused on the update of the IT data management system at MINFOF for communication to public and transparency promotion. This was conditioned by the facts on the ground in MINFOF	

Schedule

Starting date: 11 October 2011

Duration: 2 Years and half (Originally 2 Years but a six month extension without additional funds was requested and authorized)

Total amount of expenditures: analysis of applied input

The overall cost of the project was estimated at US\$ 418,626 of which US\$ 356 550 was to be used by the executing Agency (EA) to implement project activities and US\$ 62,076 by ITTO for project monitoring and administration. After 30 months of implementation, the EA

has been expended by 96 % (US\$ 343,523.42) with 85% from ITTO funding and 11% from the EA funding despite the extension of the project. According to the project's contract, there is an underspent of 15% of the project funds as found on the audit report.

4. PROJECT OUTCOME, TARGET BENEFICIARIES INVOLVEMENT

4.1. The Extent to which the project specific objective(s) was achieved

Specific Objective

The project had only one specific objective which was “To strengthen the national process for controlling illegal logging and associated trade in Cameroon”. The project Coordination could confidently affirm that the specific objective of the project had been achieved through the implementation of the planned Project activities.

4.2. The situation existing at Project Completion as compared to the pre-Project situation

The tangible outputs of the Project

This project has unique characteristics as it falls into the categories of projects which address exigent national problems and would benefit many stakeholders. This is due to the fact that the forestry-wildlife sector is a key driver of Cameroon economy and involve many and diversity of people from the highest level of the State to the indigenous people and local communities. The project produced the following results and outputs: development of training materials dedicated to forest legislation and control towards the fight against illegal logging in Cameroon; development of a database of stakeholders involved in forest law enforcement in Cameroon; initiation of a mechanism for inter-agency collaboration (inter-agency committee); identification and update of threats and gaps in timber trade legislation and traceability (Système Informatique de Gestion de l'Information Forestière-SIGIF) in Cameroon supported by two maps indicating both the official, and the illegal timber trade routes; initiation of the development of an online timber trade information management system dedicated to more transparency and communication with the wider public and stakeholders; reports documenting the gaps and threats to timber trade especially among law enforcement officials in Cameroon. The project also resulted in the identification of gaps and issues in the forest law enforcement, monitoring and control system of Cameroon including: harvesting certificates issued from fictitious and/or unaudited inventories; annual operation permits issued without proper management plans; lack of correlation between the amount of timber sold by the operators in the context of supply contracts and the forests areas allocated; lack of clear linkages between the traceability system (SIGIF) and waybills for transportation; insufficient motivation of forest and timber controllers; uncontrolled harvesting of CITES-protected tree species, disrespect of the minimum exploitable diameter, unlawful transportation of timber, etc. The consequences of these gaps and challenges are many and include: lack of credibility in the legal documents issued for the export markets; loss of revenue from taxes; increase threats to biodiversity and the reduction in income for the enhancement of the livelihood of forest communities.

The situation existing after project completion considerably justifies the project execution as there was a creation of an enabling environment for work between government stakeholders intervening in the entire timber supply chain sector. The project created an opportunity for collaboration between Forestry administration (MINFOF), Finance administration (MINFI: Customs and Tax), Justice Administration (MINJUSTICE: Magistrates) and Arms Forces

administration (MINDEF: Police and Gendarmerie) in the fight against illegal logging and associated trade in Cameroon. The project had developed the very first training toolkit that will be used for the training of law enforcement officers in Cameroon in particular and center Africa region in general. It is expected that this training toolkit will, be used in future by a broad range of people including: more staff at local levels (division and subdivision), teachers and students from national academic institutions from which the staff are trained (Forestry School at Mbalmayo, National Police Academy, National School of Administrators and Magistrates, etc.) even sharing it with some Central African countries (CAR, Congo, Gabon and DRC). The project also initiated the development of an online timber trade information management system focusing on timber trade for access by the public. This was a new development aimed at getting the public involved in the fight against illegally be encouraging information sharing.

Sectoral policies and programs

The Project did not change the existing sector policy and programs but helped in fostering and enhancing its implementation. Forest Law Enforcement is a key challenge in the forest policy and this Project has made a major contribution towards the implementation of the policy by producing a Training Manual on forest legislation and control including five modules related to : i) *Module 1 : Forestry rules and regulation in the timber sector in Cameroon;* ii) *Module 2 : Suivi des opérations forestières et systèmes de contrôle des forêts au Cameroun ;* iii) *Module 3 : Rôle du Ministère en charge des Finances dans le secteur forestier au Cameroun ;* iv) *Module 4 : Rôle des Forces de Maintien de l'Ordre dans l'application de la loi forestière au Cameroun and;* v) *Module 5 : Rôle de la Justice dans l'application de la réglementation forestière au Cameroun.*

Although the project has ended TRAFFIC intend to advocate for the mainstreaming of this manual into curriculum of the forestry school and relevant law enforcement institutions and schools in Cameroon.

The Physical Environment

The project had no direct impact on the physical environment. No field work per se was undertaking. The activities of the project were centered on organization of workshops and undertaken studies which required either desk studies of administration of questionnaires alongside interviews of relevant stakeholders.

However the project may have long-term indirectly physical impact on forest. For instance adherence to the legality framework and code of conduct would reduce illegal timber operations and therefore the rate of deforestation.

4.3. Participation of the target beneficiaries in the implementation of the Project and their utilization of the project results.

Ministry of Forestry and Wildlife (MINFOF)

MINFOF is the key beneficiary and implementation partner of the project. From the onset of the project a focal Point was nominated by MINFOF to liaise with the project manager in the implementation of the project. He was therefore closely involved in i) monitoring of the implementation of project activities by the Executing Agency based on the ITTO procedures; ii) recruitment of various as well as review of draft reports; iii) ensuring the minister is briefed on the project progress; iv) ensure that the Government engagement vis-à-vis ITTO is respected. MINFOF was the chair of the Project Technical Committee (PTC) established to steer and coordinate the project. . The focal point of MINFOF was a co-secretary of the PTC.

MINFOF played a key role in the organization of the various capacity building workshop. The MINFOF Focal Point was responsible among other things for, identification of MINFOF trainees and beneficiaries, facilitation invitations of representatives from other ministries and government agencies to meetings, presiding over meetings and reviewing reports of meetings and workshops. He even provide cover letters to facilitate the work of the consultants.

Other Ministries (Finance, Justice, Arm Forces)

Customs, taxes, Police, Gendarmerie and Justice Officials benefited from this project with 43 staff in total benefiting from the capacity building workshop on forestry law and regulations, legality, traceability and forest control. They deemed it relevant having a national interagency coordination committee for FLE to organize the forestry sector and hence increase forestry incomes for the benefice of the entire country. They participated actively in reframing the training modules to fit into field realities and proposing user friendly modules, simple, understandable and illustrative. They will continuously benefit from the project as the training kit will be produced and disseminated to their various services as well as share with academic institutions or training schools for future staff from these ministries.

Timber exploiters

Timber exploiters tend to respect the law if well monitored. If monitoring is weak, they take advantage of the gap. The general stakeholder workshop had representatives from forest exploiters. It is believed that the workshop helped built their awareness on the law and the need and advantages of respecting it as well as the consequences faced when it is flattered. Timber exploiters also participated in the provision of data during the study on timber routes conducted by the consultant.

4.4. Project Sustainability after Project Completion As A Result Of Conditions Prevailing At Completion.

The prospects of sustaining project action are good. This is because of the following factors:

- The main beneficiary of the project MINFOF was closely involved in the implementation of the project hence already support and would continue with action.
- Project results (capacity building about laws and legal frameworks relevant to law enforcement which targeted law enforcement practitioners) were directly relevant to the ongoing actions of the beneficial hence was being put to use even in the course of the project.
- Many of the project activities were are the behest of the beneficiary.
- TRAFFIC will advocate for the mainstreaming of the training manual into the curriculum of forestry schools and relevant enforcement agencies
- A proposal is being developed for submission to ITTO for second phase to complete some of the actions especially the establishment and functioning of the NCU.

5. ASSESSMENT AND ANALYSIS

5.1. Project rationale and the Project identification process

The precept that underlies or explains the project's course of action, strengthening the national process for controlling illegal logging and associated trade in Cameroon was considered by the joint team of the *EA* and the stakeholders to be fully aligned with the

Project's objective and scope and supportive of Cameroonian Growth and Employment Strategy Paper (GESP) towards 2035 emergence as well as the fulfillment of the signing of the FLEGT-Voluntary Partnership Agreement (VPA) in October 2010, and its capacity building for stakeholders in forestry sector and other relevant institutions, insuring the application of its Forestry and Wildlife Law. The Project's components continue to contribute to the strategic thrusts of improvement of the image of Cameroon's timbers on the international market to enhance the country's credibility. The outcome of the synthesis of the project after completion unanimously affirmed that stakeholder identification was holistic and adequate. In addition stakeholders were adequately represented and played key roles that encompass critical inputs that helped to achieve the objectives. The representatives of stakeholders facilitated information dissemination to their parent bodies and also supplied rich background information which helped steered the project activities to success.

5.2. Adequacy/Inadequacy of the results of the identification process

The adequacy of project identification could be considered very satisfactory as from a preliminary project funded by ITTO PD047/98 Rev.2 (M) "Establishing a data collection and dissemination system on sustainable basis for timber marketing statistics in Cameroon" it was mentioned that the Government had limited capacity to monitor forestry activities and ensure compliance by forest managers with current legislation. General workshops and discussions also mentioned lack of commitment and incentives to enforce Forest Law, poor information on timber harvest and trade in Cameroon and weak coordination between government services and between local, provincial, and central offices of single agencies. These problems were addressed in this project. In addition priority areas of ITTO were also considered to ensure compliance. The analysis of the problem as defined in the problem tree in the project document, clearly suggested an objective which transpired as the weaknesses of control of the illegal logging and associated trade in Cameroon and this was well addressed. With the problem clearly defined, plausible solutions to deter illegal logging were governed by capacity building of government law enforcement officers, discussions towards operationalization of an interagency coordination committee to address FLE and work on improving transparency and communication in the forestry sector in Cameroon. A participatory strategy to meet the objective was put in place with all stakeholders based on the facilitation role played by MINFOF. The most important substratum of the strategy was its adaptive nature to allow for quick response to unprecedented changes and variations while keeping to the objective. Two activities were reframed based on the previous statement, putting forward the work done by other organization and avoiding duplication.

5.3. The most critical differences between planned and actual project implementation

Significant efforts were put into implementation strategy as well as in the workplan. This was to ensure that planned and actual implementation would be in unison. This modus operandi worked to expectation with minimum and insignificant differences between planned and actual. Nevertheless there were some critical differences. It was expected that Finance officials (Customs and Tax) have been trained in FLE through two training of trainers' workshops but they attended just one. Despite the help of the Minister of Forestry and Wildlife, and repeated request, reminders and invitations for the nomination of finance officials to participate in the first training workshop; no finance officials showed up. This critical situation led to more internal meetings and advocacy to encourage the participation of the Ministry of Finance, one of the key target audience of the project. During the entire implementation of the project, another critical problem was related to the transfers of trained officials related to their permanent movement within government institutions. From one training of trainers' workshop to another it was noticed that a significant number of officials from a ministry trained in the first workshop were different for the second workshop. More

positively (technically), capacity building sessions during the implementation of this project have attracted much interest from several partners who participated actively and in numbers in the first training workshop. CARPE brought in participants from Central African countries namely : the Central African Republic, the Republic of Congo, the Republic of Gabon and the Democratic Republic of Congo; although there were some impact on the original budget.

More significantly, after the first two training workshops the coordination of the project found that capacity building activities were very important but costly, therefore not matching with the original budget as indicated in the project document. From the first instalment received the available amount felt under the 25% requirement for a request of another instalment, but due to the fact that the first year audit was planned and took place, this instalment took more time to be released. Indeed The audit process has been delayed while obtaining the required documentation support from IUCN, TRAFFIC's host finance administrator in the field. This was in large part the result of various staff changes in Yaounde. The expense verification component of the audit was completed relatively quickly, but the delay has been with the systems audit component with supporting documentation for financial systems, policies and procedures. This delay impacted the release of funds installments from ITTO with a consequence on achievement of activities related to various studies: i) elaboration of the FLE workplan; ii) monitoring of the FLE in Cameroon with the development of a code of conduct and professional ethics; iii) the status of the traceability systems in Cameroon and iv) the preliminary assessment of the IT development system at MINFOF with focus on more transparency and communication towards wider public. These studies which are under review will be submitted to ITTO early October 2014.

It would be most appreciated if ITTO could support the Cameroon government among other things to consolidate results from this project and especially encourage for the establishment and operationalizing of the interagency coordination committee for Forest Law Enforcement (FLE).

5.4. Time And Project Inputs: Personnel And Equipment, Financial Resources, Knowledge And Expertise

The implementation of this project took a longer time than initially planned. A no cost extension had to be requested and was approved by ITTO. A number of reasons accounted for this need for extension; delay in the start of the project, underestimation of the requirement of some of the project activities; difficulties in working with many stakeholders, government bureaucracy and bottlenecks; difficulties face with the first project audit; poor reports of some of the consultants.

The project coordination employed a professional as a forest and trade officer to attend to day-to-day activities of the project. He was supported by key colleagues in the TRAFFIC network especially the Regional Director for TRAFFIC in Central Africa; the TRAFFIC International Timber Trade Programmes Leader and the Senior Programme Officer, TRAFFIC Central Africa for technical issues. For financial and administration issues he was supported by the Project Administrative Officer, TRAFFIC International (managing finance at international level) and Administrative & Financial Officer, TRAFFIC Central Africa (managing finance at national level). For communication matters the Communication Officer, TRAFFIC Central Africa supported the team in sharing information on all events organized by the project and participated to the production of communication element for advocacy. The MINFOF Focal Point of the project and Consultants were also part of the project implementation providing their expertise coordinating and collaborating with other stakeholders under the supervision of the Project Coordinator. Therefore the project did not suffer from lack of knowledge or expertise. Financial resources were not adequate due to

underestimation of many activities related to inflation that resulted in a general high cost of living. Another financial difficulty was the delay in releasing other installments after the first one by ITTO. This state of affairs put undue pressure on management of the project. Finally, the EA found it difficult in bearing at the last minute the audit fees which were not budgeted in the original project document. In spite of all these, at the end of the project, some funds remained unspent as mentioned in the section 3.1. This was because of the delay in completion of a study which did not allow time for a validation workshop to be completed by the end of the project in April 2014.

5.5. Anticipation and reality of external influences, assumptions and risks and the effectiveness of mitigating measures

This project did face a little external influence as roles and responsibilities of all partners in the implementation were not fully respected. The assumptions and risks as proposed in the project document were contained and adequate provisions were made to assuage such occurrence as far as risk were concerned. Nomination of finance officials took time but occurred because the project coordination did strong advocacy for this to happen.

5.6. The participation of anticipated and actual Project beneficiaries in Project implementation and how they have and will be benefiting from the Project

Government services officials from the Ministry of Forestry and Wildlife (MINFOF), Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Arm Forces (Police and Gendarmerie), Forest exploiters were the beneficiaries. The project went beyond these beneficiaries and targeted also the Prime Minister Office, civil society organizations, parliamentarians, research institutions, academic institutions and even magistrates from some Central African countries (CAR, Congo, Gabon and DRC). These stakeholders were duly represented in the implementation of the project. They will all benefit from the training kit developed, take advantage of the code of conduct and professional ethics produced to fit into their respective domains as well as being targeted as potential members of the interagency coordination committee for FLE in Cameroon. The Project also spent during its implementation phase a significant amount of time on the dissemination of lessons learnt and sharing of project results and other related information to various partners, through the organization of meetings, side meetings, workshops and presentations at various fora with an objective of reaching out a wider audience.

5.7. Sustainability after Project Completion

The Executing Agency and other stakeholders considered the sustainability of the project during the last technical meeting to validate training materials of the project. A general consensus was that the EA should finalize the production of these training materials, share with all stakeholders who will form the core of the people who will work towards ensuring the transparency and good governance of the forestry sector. These stakeholders should continue to disseminate the project findings and implement them at their level and encourage their usage. Advocacy to MINFOF to own and institutionalize the interagency coordination committee for FLE under the supervision of the Prime Minister offices, for continuous updating of timbers routes information and monitoring of legality. Other sources (.e.g. Yearly Ministry budget or fund from PSFE) will be sourced to support such commitment. The results of the project activities will be also used in providing guidelines to Cameroon for the fulfillment of the FLEGT VPA signed with EU.

5.8. The understanding and appropriateness of the roles and responsibilities of the institutions involved with the project implementation.

The institutions involved in the project implementation as stated in the project document were carefully selected after consultations and appropriateness status considered. The MINFOF Focal Point was nominated by a ministerial decision, beneficiaries from all ministries took part in the implementation of the project thanks to ministerial nominations; the Project Technical Committee with partners like MINFOF, IUCN, WWF, Independent Observer and ITTO was put in place by a ministerial decree. In addition, the selected institutions have been working with the Ministry of Forestry and Wildlife (MINFOF) at different levels and different times so their capabilities were known to MINFOF. Each institution had a good understanding of its roles and responsibilities in the Project and contributed significantly to the implementation of relevant activities and provision of specialized services.

6. LESSONS LEARNED

6.1. Development Lessons

To the results obtained by this project, the identification of problems to solve was relevant even if it was not appropriate of having to some extent ambitious activities without adequate budgeting. For instance activity 3.2. in the original project document was: *'set-up timber origin tracing systems and install timber monitoring equipment'*, which cannot be achieved as designed because of the huge time and money needed but also that other projects were implementing this during the project duration. The activity was therefore reframed to cope with the reality in the field into *'Supporting current development of traceability systems that the government of Cameroon is developing and testing'*. Meantime it was also observed that at the project formulation stage, the liaison between the project coordination and MINFOF was thought technically with the presence of a Focal Point but not financially. Readjustment took place and was approved by ITTO to consider a budget for the Focal Point within the project for his communication costs, transportation, printing and photocopy, etc.

Relevant parties' interest in the project was undermined by under budgeting for various activities. Therefore cooperation could have been improved through seeking of additional funding from other sources besides ITTO. This was experimented during the project implementation with CARPE who brought from Central African countries participants to one capacity building session to learn from Cameroon's initiatives that can be duplicated in their respective countries.

This project had only one objective aiming at strengthening the national process for controlling illegal logging and associated trade in Cameroon in order to contribute to transparency of timber trade in Cameroon with a view to address the problems of unsustainable timber harvesting, weak forest law enforcement and illegal trade of the country's timber. In this regard, training materials were produced to build capacities of government officials, a code of conduct and professional ethics for forest controllers have been produced, a workplan for FLE finalized, reports produced on i) timber trade routes in Cameroon; ii) updates on the development of the traceability system in Cameroon; iii) monitoring of FLE levels in Cameroon and; iv) updates on IT data management system for forest sector information that reaches wider public. This will benefit all stakeholders. These key deliverables were disseminated; MINFOF will continue to promote them as part of its institutional mandate.

6.2. Operational Lessons

The project organisation and management was under the leadership of the Project Coordinator steering the affairs of the project implementation team. The team was meeting regularly to discuss progress of work and to forecast unprecedented events which might retard the progress of the work. Members worked in harmony with the Project Coordinator and the MINFOF Focal Point of the project and collaborating institutions. This strategy was very successful and led to good achievement of the project objective.

The success of the project could be attributed to the continuous steering of project activity being guided by the project design and incorporation of constructive suggestions from stakeholders and the Project Technical Committee (PTC). Two annual PTC meetings with a representative from ITTO were observed. This enabled the project to be vigorously reviewed. Opportunity was also given to the executing agency to do presentation to update the participants. These meetings often subjected the project to constructive criticisms which helped steer the project. The meetings also created opportunity for innovative suggestions and ideas from ITTO. Though, we strongly think that two meetings of the PTC in 30 months of implementation of the project were insufficient.

One major obstacle of project implementation was the fact that planned and actual implementations were out of synchrony after the launch of the capacity building phase due to delay in release of the second and third installments of the budget. This problem which was internal to the EA and its host partner in Cameroon, could be resolved if audits could have been taken place in-situ for audit reports (triggers of installments) to be release on time. The Project EA could not source funds from alternative source to conduct key activities (training of trainer's workshop) for more than six months. The workplan was quite rigid and related to budget lines with respect to some activities which required longer period of execution and money not known to the planning team. This state of affairs was translated into higher cost and request for extension. A more realistic workplan would have prevented this.

The main external factors that influenced the project implementation and which were not properly factored into the project planning were on one hand the rapid change in the economic environment and in the another hand government bureaucracy and bottlenecks. The Project did not make enough provision for the price variation with time regarding the supply of goods and services by hotels to organize the various workshops which were higher than estimated in the project document. The bureaucracy involved in nominating officials from beneficiary ministries resulted in almost eight month's delay for one of the training activity. Bottlenecks were quite often encountered during data collection in various ministries for the different studies conducted, the project suffered from reservation of information delivery at different level. At the same time it was realized that trained officials from some ministries changes within sessions due to the rapid shift of post of government officials (promotion and appointments being commonplace of ministries). It's recommended that Focal Points of projects be appointed at the level of ministries without changing to play fully their role by updating regularly the decision makers in the person of their Minister.

Activities of the project were documented for the public and stakeholders both in electronic form and in hard copies. At the beginning of the project implementation 1000 brochures were produced (500 hard copies in French and English each as well as electronic copies) and disseminated among all the stakeholders. The project submitted bi-annual reports as per ITTO conditions. Six project progress reports were prepared according to ITTO guidelines and delivered in electronic form on time. All other relevant data and activity reports will be submitted to ITTO separately. An important work has been done to keep partners updated on the project via various communication channels notably : web news releases (links available); local newspapers editions (hard copies available); radio interviews (electronic support available); radio broadcasting (registered broadcasting available); TV prerecorded

shots presented in news edition (recorded CD available); Yammer TRAFFIC professional communication network; PowerPoints presentations and a photograph album with more than 1000 pictures. The reality is that all this communication work need subsequent budget which was not well framed, therefore it is at the design stage that aspects of communication should be well taken into account for wide dissemination of the good knowledge and understanding of all partners, stakeholders and general public on the project's outcomes.

7. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1. Conclusions and Recommendations

Identification

The project and its objectives are very relevant to the country and would allow the government to make sure that : (1) all actors concerned in the timber sector are complying with their fiscal obligations and timber royalties and taxes are paid as required by the forest law, and to consequently receive all the tax income from timber harvesting and export; (2) the logging companies respect forest laws and regulations relating to timber harvesting and transportation, and the rights of forest communities; (3) the forest communities get their share of tax revenue from the harvested timber; (4) the image of Cameroon's timbers on the international market will improve to enhance the country's credibility and (5) the coordination of government services is set-up in order to help to make sure that the results will be sustainable. The project provided a good environment in implementation capacity of Forest Law Enforcement (FLE) of the Ministry of Forests and Wildlife (MINFOF) and other enforcement services such as police, gendarmerie, finance and customs; and promoted coordination of relevant government services for forest law enforcement. The project identified a priority need of the forest sector based on stakeholder concerns and results of the timber trade routes update study; and provided a solution to it through capacity building. Stakeholder response to the Project has been very positive with people generally expressing the wish for more capacity building. It can be concluded that the project identification criteria was successful and yielded significant results although the interagency coordination committee for FLE is not yet established by Prime Minister's decree and operationalized, even though steps have been taken to enable the establishment in due course.

Design

Project was designed to conform to the ITTO format. The workplan and essential components were done by experts from the Ministry of Forestry and Wildlife (MINFOF) to ensure logical and hierarchical implementation to achieve objectives. Some difficulties were observed in the implementation phase due to approximate budget evaluation. It is therefore recommended that after a proposal is drafted, it should be submitted first to a review committee of the Ministry in charge, which should have insight from the initiator before an expert final review. This expert profile should be on line with the knowledge of ITTO's manual on standard operating procedures for the ITTO project cycle and budgeting.

Implementation

The project implementation was very successful taking into consideration results obtained vis-à-vis challenges the project coordination underwent; all the planned activities were carried out as expected more or less and the outputs and objectives were achieved, though deliverables will be submitted separately. The implementation commenced with inception meetings with partners introducing the project and continued during the first training of trainer's workshop where orientation for participants took place as to further enhance their understanding of the project and its importance. There was a smooth collaboration both at

the institutional and individual scientist's level. The project underwent one extension with justification without additional funds from ITTO.

Organisation

The project at its start benefited from a nominated Focal Point from MINFOF, and was headed by the Project Coordinator who was supported by Senior Supervisors for backstopping and consultants. The way the project was organized ensured that individuals took responsibility for the execution of specific activities and reported on them, working within the timeline as much as possible.

Management

The Project leadership style was an open one that enabled team members to contribute towards decision-making on the project. Apart from the regular Project Technical Committee meetings which were very useful for team members to seek clarifications and offer constructive criticisms and suggestions, the project coordination met often to attend to the needs of consultants and also assess level of performance to ensure that targets were met within the time frame. Though some consultants were not up to the task, giving additional work to the EA in reviewing draft reports of some studies. Suggestions and directions were always available leading to intra-operational cohesion, unfortunately delivery of some reports were completed with delays. It's therefore recommended for the next projects, to have a repertory of high level consultants according to their expertise and field of action. The project was implemented strictly under the recommendations of the project coordination issuing guiding principles and in conformity with ITTO regulations. Regular meetings among members of the implementation team should be encouraged to discuss performance and strategize to overcome difficulties and challenges. It is also recommended that project staffs are well estimated (in number) and motivated accordingly to ensure success of the project.

In a general view of design, implementation and management of ITTO projects, it will be advantageous for ITTO to develop a program on capacity building towards beneficiaries of their projects, for successful implementation and more impacts on Tropical Timbers Producer's Countries, learning from other similar projects, in order to fight against illegal timber distraction and promote economic development and alleviate poverty.

7.2. Potential for replication and/or for scaling up

The Project has a high potential for scaling up due to the process and procedure it has established and the linkages it has produced. Once the training kits are available they can be easily used by the project primary beneficiaries but also by other secondary and tertiary beneficiaries. This project is a prototype with high capacity for replication in other Central African countries as it deals with bringing solution to Forest Law Enforcement, to combat illegal logging and associated trade while promoting coordinated actions between all stakeholders. The procedure for collaboration, role assignment, need assessment and prioritization are documented. This will makes it easy for replication elsewhere.

Responsible for the Report

Name: *Denis Mahonghol*

Position held: *Project Coordinator*

Sign:

Date: 18 July 2014

Annexes

Annex 1 Project financial statement

PLEASE REFER TO THE SECOND AUDIT REPORT SUBMITTED AS A SEPARATE DOCUMENT

Annex 2 Project cash flow statement

PLEASE REFER TO THE SECOND AUDIT REPORT SUBMITTED AS A SEPARATE DOCUMENT